

**Electric Lights Cast Long Shadows:  
Seeking the Greater Good in a World of Competing Clarities**

\*\*\*

John M. Staudenmaier, S.J.

**The Boardman Lecture**

Departments of Religious Studies and History and Sociology of Science  
The University of Pennsylvania  
April 14, 2005

**Introduction**

A two sentence theological thesis underlies what follows here; taken together, these sentences, represent my core conviction about how Christians, and more specifically Christians living in the Roman Catholic tradition understand the discipline of making decisions in obedience to God's will. Here are the two sentences. "The world is good before it is suspect" and "Conversion is gradual more than it is sudden." In the long history of Christian practice these are matters of emphasis. Certainly the world provides plenty reasons for suspicion and sometimes one experiences grace as a sudden intervention in one's life. But Roman Catholic emphasis goes the other way, and takes the logic of the Incarnation as primary in the sense that God makes a home within the human condition and, as it were, takes that home seriously. Thus Catholics regard popes, bishops, priests and other spiritual leaders -- and everyone else -- with a historically grounded affection that expects to encounter the vagaries of the human condition at every point in anyone's life story; or at least Catholics incline toward such realistic affection when behaving well. When behaving badly, Catholics tend toward complacent or cynical tolerance for corrupt and mediocre behavior. They have less propensity toward another religious disorder, excessive and arrogant righteousness.

Lived well or poorly, this world view is grounded in the understanding that one ought to look for God within the ordinary fabric of life more than in extraordinary interventions from a divine place outside daily life. Catholics baptize babies, welcoming them into the faith life of the community, long before they are mature enough to make the radical sort of choice often referred to as being "born again." Catholics emphasize the life long need for mercy and forgiveness; Reconciliation is a sacrament with theological stature not unlike baptism. The confession of sinfulness with which every Eucharist begins includes every member of the worshipping community, priestly celebrant and congregation alike. Thus the quotidian fabric of reality, flawed and beautiful, constitutes the primary place to encounter God's active redeeming grace. Therefore, followers of the incarnate Jesus should try to read the signs of their particular time and the graces and flaws which shape their era. It also follows that one's specific culture should be approached more with affection, as a human context which God chooses to love and live in, than with suspicion, as if God were alien from this moment of the human condition. Such is the premise of that which follows.

This lecture has two parts: in Part One I will consider a commonplace technology, electric lights, asking what they might tell us about the cultural fabric of the world in which we live.<sup>1</sup> My intention is to interrogate artificial lighting in order to frame the theological exploration with which Part Two is concerned: the spiritual habit of "seeking the greater good," found in the in the handbook of mystical prayer titled The Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius of Loyola, (founder of the Jesuits, 1492-1556). Seeking "the greater good" implies that I find my way in prayer to a vantage point from which my available options are goods among which I try to choose that which is greater. This implies that none of my available options rises to the level of an absolute. According to the Exercises, one seeks to discern the greater of the available goods, not one absolute good. It will take some work to tease out the implications of this kind of prayer and decision making but it is worth the labor. I will argue that the habit of approaching the world with reverent affection -- a necessary condition for choosing among goods rather than bads -- is more needed in this historical moment than in many another. Perhaps because the end of the Cold War erased a half century of world wide stability enforced by two competing powers, we live in a time of decentralized local conflicts and sharp edged ideological battles, some religious, some going by other names such as "the free market." At their worst, partisans fight other partisans (and non-partisan bystanders) as if any force or tactic is morally acceptable, as in the wretched expression "error has no rights" and it's tacit corollary, "we partisans define what is truth and what is error." I offer what follows as a theological reflection aimed at healing the societal disease of dueling absolute ideologies.<sup>2</sup>

### **Part One: What happened to the Holy Dark in the West: Electric Lights as societal wish fulfillment:**

To read the inner valences of any society it helps to interrogate its successful technologies as if they were peculiar rather than ordinary, to problematize them in order to pay attention to their host society.<sup>3</sup> Any deeply embedded technology can be so interrogated: piped and pumped water; automobiles; computer mediated information systems; petroleum-based synthetic materials. So too electric lights. "What is it about the industrial capitalist societies of Western-Northern Europe and the United States that explains their fierce embrace

---

<sup>1</sup> Here I will only sketch the contours of the relationship of electric lights with modern Western culture. For a more thorough discussion see my: "Denying the Holy Dark: The Enlightenment and the European Mystical Tradition," in Progress: Fact of Illusion? Leo Marx and Bruce Mazlish eds., (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1996):175-200.

<sup>2</sup> By emphasizing the current era's proclivity for absolutized ideological causes and by suggesting some factors which may help explain the pattern, I do not mean to discount earlier historical moments when absolute claims to righteousness generated more than ordinary violence. My intention, rather, is to contextualize the present time with its particular challenges.

<sup>3</sup> For a thorough articulation of the expression "successful technology" see my "The Politics of Successful Technologies," In Context: History and the History of Technology: Essays in Honor of Melvin Kranzberg, eds. Stephen Cutcliffe and Robert Post, (Lehigh University Press, 1988):150-171.

of this peculiar technology, electric lighting? Why would these societies evolve to the point where reliable artificial lighting came to be experienced as inevitable and normal?<sup>4</sup>

Every culture until the recent past perceived the diurnal rhythm of day and night, dawn and dusk, as essential dimensions of human experience. The night "fell" at its time and human activities that required good light -- planning, any kind of measuring, most work, all those tasks that required separating out some set of resources to use for some pre-defined purpose -- ceased. In the dim of night, people tended to gather in what they hoped would be safe places. In their night prayers they asked to be protected from the dangers of the night -- please no crises in the dark that would require bright light; please no attacks from dangerous humans or animals or weather. Night was frightening, everyone knew that, and it made any kind of work mightily inconvenient at best.

But these same cultures also understood the dark to be holy, a time when human beings were opened to visions, and play, and tenderness, and sleep, and dreams. The Psalmist praised sleep as the time of God: "In vain do you put off going to bed and get up earlier, sweating to make your living, since God provides for God's beloved while they are sleeping." Ps. 127. To stay with Judaeo-Christian scripture, powerful and life-shaping visions of Abraham, Samuel, and Jesus emerge in the frightening dark.<sup>5</sup> Nor was bright light always considered good. One of the devil's names, "Lucifer" (light carrier), references the understanding that sometimes too much clarity turns violent, a wisdom tradition found also in the silence with which the books of Job and Jonah end. Greek tradition understood this too, nowhere more horribly than in Oedipus. Warned repeatedly by the Chorus that there are some things one should not seek to discover, Oedipus pursues clarity and when he finds it, puts out his eyes. He has seen too much. Light is sometimes holy, sometimes violent. Dark is sometimes violent, sometimes holy.

From this theological perspective the most astonishing aspect of the modern era in Europe, beginning early in the 17th century, is the gradual de-legitimation of the holy dark and western mystical traditions, all of which presumed virtues learned first by living with dim light -- receptivity to uncertainties; awareness of kinship with realities larger than oneself; openness to having one's own agenda interrupted; in a word, the virtues of intimacy. Almost two centuries before the first effective electric lighting system (1882), the night began to get a bad name. How, one might ask, did European elites move from Shakespeare and Montaigne and Thomas

---

<sup>4</sup> On the power of often invisible infrastructure to shape societal reality see Susan Leigh Star, "The Ethnography of Infrastructure," American Behavioral Scientist Vol 43, no.2 (November/December 1999):377-391.

<sup>5</sup> For the promise to Abraham see Genesis 15:12-21; to Samuel see 1 Samuel, 3:1-14. The Transfiguration of Jesus, Moses and Elijah in the New Testament is often interpreted as an experience of brilliant light which it is. The voice of God, however, is heard after a cloud overshadows the watching disciples; see Mark 9:2-8: "He [Peter] did not know what to say; they were so frightened. And a cloud came, covering them in shadow; and there came a voice from the cloud, "This is my Son, the Beloved."

Out of long habit and rhetorical affection I use translations from The Jerusalem Bible (New York: Doubleday 1966), Alexander Jones, General Editor.

More to DesCartes's insistence on clear and distinct ideas?<sup>6</sup> That the Enlightenment fostered commitment to rational method and precision measurement and that this methodological revolution has transformed the scientific and technological dimensions of life is a commonplace that is accepted, I suspect, by all of us in this room. That said, and I do not intend to denigrate it, the move from Shakespeare's "sleep that knits the ravelled sleeve of care" to 18th century theological condemnations of the night and of darkness generally marks a stunning cultural turn.<sup>7</sup> To cite one text from many, consider a line from John Wesley's 1786 sermon on the duty and advantage of early rising where he reverses Psalm 127's call to trust sleep:

"By soaking . . . so long between warm sheets the flesh is as it were parboiled, and becomes soft and flabby. The nerves in the meantime, are quite unstrung."<sup>8</sup>

The radical transformation of Europe's theological and moral aesthetic during the rise of Western scientific method and precision measurement deserves much more detailed attention than these few words.<sup>9</sup> I hope they are sufficient to open the 20th century's penchant for electric lighting to fresh consideration. Seen from this four century perspective, electric lighting systems look like the technological fulfillment of a deep seated longing to escape the inevitability of the night. Excellent artificial light, available 24 hours each day, can work like a reverse narcotic. Ours is the only era where those who are not wealthy can afford insomnia. Sleep clinics and sleep research, recent signs of scientific concern about excessive wakefulness, are unique to this era.

What are the societal liabilities of a people which has lost access to the night as a inevitable and communal experience? Sleep deprivation surely. Perhaps too, we have absorbed an expectation that immediate access to clarity, about anything, is almost an absolute right for citizens of contemporary society. It would be hard to prove but one might wonder whether the loss of the unavoidable night as a training ground might have eroded the ability to wait attentively when uncertain. I wonder too, whether there might be a connection between a quasi-addictive need for light as it has played out in the 20th century evolution of U.S. society and evidence of a declining capacity to negotiate about important matters in the public and the personal order.<sup>10</sup> Negotiating requires the habit of holding one's own agenda open (and therefore uncertain) while learning the perspectives of those with whom I negotiate, a habit of

---

<sup>6</sup> For an accessible interpretation of the shift in Europe's intellectual climate from the late 16th century to the mid 17th century see Steven Toulmin, Cosmopolis: The Hidden Agenda of Modernity (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992)

<sup>7</sup> Bartlett's Concordance of Shakespeare contains only six citations for slough and 11 for lazy but requires four complete columns for citations of sleep, most of them positive. Bartlett's Concordance (London: Macmillan, 1894; St. Martin's 1979).

<sup>8</sup> The text is famously to be found with others of the same sort in E.P. Thompson, "Time, Work-Discipline, and Industrial Capitalism," in Past and Present no. 38 (December 1967):87-88.

<sup>9</sup> For a more theologically oriented interpretation that nonetheless echoes Toulmin, (op. cit.), see William C. Platcher, The Domestication of Transcendence (Louisville: John Knox Press, 1996).

<sup>10</sup> Of course the patterns which I suggest as operating in US society generally are not limited to the United States and are more tangled and complex than this sketch can indicate. For a more complete argument see my "United States Technology and Adult Commitment," Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits Vol 19 no 1 (January 1987):1-37.

perceiving those with whom I negotiate as good more than as suspect, where the essential kinship of a common humanity tempers the suspicion, fear and anger that often attend conflicts which require negotiation in the first place. Negotiations work best when people are at home with emotions and have staying power to work toward a durable agreement. This is true internationally; true in an intimate relationship; true in a workplace.

At the risk of oversimplification, I will hazard a hypothesis that a pattern of societal tendencies, privileging strategy over negotiation and certitudes over curiosity, began to gain momentum in the wake of World War Two and the half century of its Cold War aftermath. The moral and civic legitimacy of virtues learned in dim light, long treated with suspicion in the West's Enlightenment world view, looked even more suspect when the world's fate appeared so convincingly to feature a noble war against unambiguously evil enemies. Hitler and Stalin, from this perspective, provided a luxury rare in human history, enemies who lived up to the demonizing hype of their opponents. A half century of near consensus in the United States about a well defined enemy, surely a luxury for political leaders conducting foreign policy, left myriad local situations with sometimes virulent tensions unattended and waiting to erupt. One ought not be surprised, then, at violent and local-specific conflicts between partisans who enforce boundaries to fence in legitimate insiders and fence out despicable outsiders. We live in a time when harsh and unforgiving absolutes present themselves as nearly inevitable.

Nor is it surprising that in this same period so many citizens of western or westernized societies have begun to seek nourishment in mystical traditions from East and West or in more eclectic and evanescent congeries of wisdom fragments. In the rest of this lecture I will try to tease out one strand from one such tradition, the five century old handbook for guiding prayer and decision making written by the founder of the Jesuits, the mystic Ignatius of Loyola.<sup>11</sup> If the night has gotten bad press during the modernist period, Ignatius has fared even worse, at least in some circles. The priority he gave to emotional experience as well as his capacity for tenderness and for life-long friendships are less well known than his organizational genius. Nonetheless, his enduring masterwork, the Spiritual Exercises, unquestionably teaches an affective mystical discipline and is unmistakably autobiographical. The text of the Exercises codifies his experience during the tumultuous year he spent living in a cave on the outskirts of the Spanish town, Manresa, during 1527. Ignatius wrote the Exercises in the historical moment

---

<sup>11</sup> In what follows I will cite, in preference to more recent editions, the translation by Louis J. Puhl, S.J., The Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius Based on Studies in the Language of the Autograph, (Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1951). All my citations of the text will follow the common convention of paragraph numbers.

For several centuries the standard Jesuit interpretation of The Spiritual Exercises (henceforth "the Exercises") embodied the general Enlightenment bias against mystical prayer. Since the end of World War Two, however, the 16th century "Directories," manuals of advice for directors of the Exercises, have become a subject of serious study by Jesuits and many others of a growing school of students of the Exercises. Over the last four decades, then, the affective subtleties with which I will be concerned in this lecture have experienced a renaissance.

when Europe looked back toward its medieval roots while looking outward toward global adventures.

One might say that about the mid 16th century Jesuits, I privilege the technology of navigation over the printing press and see the Lutheran and Calvinist reformations as less important formative influences for Ignatius and the first Jesuits than the more deep seated tension between a medieval consciousness and the first century of European global navigation.<sup>12</sup> The Exercises reflect the mentality of the first Jesuits both by their typically medieval sensuality in matters of place and body and by situating the call of Jesus in a global frame of reference. While I concentrate in Part Two on the sensual practice of treating prayer as a journey toward or away from specific places, Ignatius' world-wide awareness ought not to be ignored. Sensual prayer, in the Exercises, is not parochial.<sup>13</sup>

### **Part Two: Seeking the Greater Good According to The Spiritual Exercises**

The Exercises, true to their era of formation, treat the search for the place where I am called to pray as the heart of prayer. The methodological heart of the Exercises is geographical and is to be found in Ignatius's counsel to follow the trails left by affective experiences. When making the Exercises I am to seek the interior place where I desire to pray at the present moment. This geographical discipline extends beyond the interior world; I am also counselled to look for the most helpful physical place available to me. Ignatius approaches the sensual logistics of prayer pragmatically. When making the Exercises I seek places, postures, and times of the day that help me -- sitting with a cup of coffee looking through a particular window, walking down a particular street, sitting in a darkened room, lying face down on the ground, sitting in a comfortable chair. Shall I pray in the early morning? after dinner? Shall I rise in the middle of the night? I am encouraged to experiment until I find what satisfies me. I am also encouraged to expect to be surprised at the places I find. In short, I try to perceive the entire context within which I live while making the exercises as welcoming me and as capable of revealing unexpected blessings if I can grow supple enough to perceive them.

The interior terrain within which I pray operates according to the same principle. My inner condition can reveal unexpected mysteries if I allow it to welcome me. I must pay attention to the play of my emotions as my most important guide to the place to which I desire

---

<sup>12</sup> This is not to say that the reformation had no influence on Jesuit consciousness in the generation after Ignatius but that the commonplace interpretation of the Jesuits as founded in response to the reformation overestimates the inchoate nature of early reformation initiatives. Larger matters were at stake in sixteenth century Europe than the early denominational skirmishes between followers of Luther, Calvin, the Church of England, and Roman Catholics which would erupt into the much more significant religious wars of the early 17th century. John O'Malley, S.J. provides the most sophisticated interpretation of the world view and behavior of the Jesuits in the 16th century in two books. Trent and All that: Renaming Catholicism in the Early Modern Era (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2000) and The First Jesuits (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press 1993).

<sup>13</sup> For a few more specific reflections on this point see Appendix One below: "The Spiritual Exercises as medieval about sensuality and modern about geography."

to give my attention. Ignatius distinguishes consolations and desolations -- joy, playfulness, serenity, exuberance; alienation, bitterness, cynicism, boredom, panic.<sup>14</sup> One ought not, however, seek consolation and try to overcome desolation, Interior affectivity is not to be managed but to be treated as one's guide and ally, It is the play of both consolation and desolation within me that guides me to where I am at a given moment in my life. Thus the Exercises see consolations and desolations as equally helpful. In fact, the only warning sign of a retreat going badly to be found anywhere in the text of the Exercises appears as a caution for the director in #6. If the retreatant "is not affected by any spiritual experiences, such as consolations or desolations . . . and . . . is not troubled by different spirits . . ." the director should intervene and, in effect, ask the retreatant what is the matter. The interventionist language of #6 stands in stark contrast to all other advice about how the director should relate with the retreatant. Thus, in # 15:

"Therefore, the director of the Exercises, as a balance at equilibrium, without leaning to one side or the other, should permit the Creator to deal directly with the creature, and the creature directly with the Creator and Lord."

Again in # 2: the director, when explaining a next place of prayer, should:

". . . add only a short or summary explanation . . ." [lest too much talk by the director get in the way of the retreatant who should] ". . . reflect on it for himself . . . . For it is not much knowledge that fills and satisfies the soul but the intimate understanding and relish of the truth."(# 2)

To what place might my emotions lead? One is often surprised. A few years ago, a determined young adult began six silent days of retreat by informing me that she planned to pray about finishing her doctorate, getting married and going on the job market. The next day she came furious. "I cried all night! My father died two years ago! I did that already!" In fact, she grieved most of the six days, time spent mostly in anger, loss, and grief, a wonderful retreat. Sometimes people enter retreat certain that they are burnt out: exhausted, angry, alarmingly bitter -- only to find in the quiet nothing but playful joy. Joy can surprise and confuse just as much as anger or grief. For Ignatius, one approaches the place of one's desire, guided by consolations or desolations or both, not knowing yet why the place is important.

The maxim, that attention to affectivity and capacity for surprise are necessary conditions for prayer, is taught during the Exercises so that it can serve as a way of prayer for ordinary life.<sup>15</sup> It is a method of prayer oriented to decision making, and in particular toward deciding whether to stay in the place where I find myself or to seek, among available options, some new place which would be the "greater good" for me at this moment of my life. In

---

<sup>14</sup> For Ignatius' vivid descriptions of both states see ## 316 and 317.

<sup>15</sup> The Exercises refer to the habit of inner attention in ordinarily life under two headings. In # 19 Ignatius explains that people who are too busy to make the Exercises in 24 hour silence can spread the experience over as long a time as is helpful, praying a little each day and seeing the director periodically. The daily habit, when not on a retreat in any form, is called the "general examination of conscience." See # 43.

ordinary life, decisions about the greater good are sometimes momentous and sometimes of modest import. To suggest a few examples of questions which might open into surprises: should I spend more time grieving my father's death? is it time to give attention to my intuitions about changing jobs? to invest time and energy supporting someone's political campaign? to confront the masked and muted violences in our marriage? to stop work for a bit and get some coffee? to take Saturday afternoon off and go motorcycling? to sell my motorcycle? to email a friend? One prays best, according to the Exercises, with a supple awareness that where my attention and my body are now may be where I desire to stay longer, or may not. How long should I stay when I have found the place I have sought? Ignatius says only that I stay "until I have been satisfied" (# 76 no. 2).<sup>16</sup>

My body occupies only one perspective at a time and I travel a unique path through the world, acquiring a unique history. I approach any moment of prayer with an inner awareness shaped by where I have been, what I have learned, which memories matter most to me. From the perspective of the Exercises, the bedrock of healthy prayer is respect for my capacity for presence in place and in time. Prayer is sensual as well as spiritual.<sup>17</sup> I always seek to be at home where I am and to be open to finding a new place at the same time. I determine whether to stay or to seek a next place by trusting that my emotional responses will help me to discern God's leading. By living attentive to what I desire and learning to sort out my true desires from deceptive emotions I can form a habit of seeking the "greater good" as it is available to me in the world as I find it. To the significance of the expression, "the greater good" we now turn.<sup>18</sup>

We come to the heart of the matter. Before I try to lay out the theological argument, let me discuss what is at stake here. If the Exercises teach a method of being present where I am now while being open to moving on, what is to prevent this becoming a drifter's lifestyle, caring for no one and for no place, living always with an eye to what might be better, an emotional style made casually famous in the vignette of someone who, while talking with me at a party, surreptitiously scans the room over my shoulder in search of one more interesting than I. What sort of prayer is it that forms a habit of deep affection for where I find myself but an

---

<sup>16</sup> References to place and one's body pervade the Exercises. One standard preparation for contemplation is called "the composition of place" (introduced in #47 & passim); in #118 The retreatant is counseled to return to prior experience in the last day or two, giving my attention to "... more important parts in which one has experienced understanding, consolation, or desolation"; see ##122-25 for the "application of the five senses" as the last prayer in a day of contemplation; #127 teaches the retreatant not to look ahead "... lest the consideration of one mystery interfere with the contemplation of the other"; Be where you are.

<sup>17</sup> Joy Parr's interrogation of vernacular knowledge as sensual and local; and as operating in tension with "scientific expertise tied more to profession than to place" can be found in her "Local water diversely known: Walkerton Ontario, 2000 and after" in Environment and Planning D: Society and Space 2005, volume 23, in press. Sources to related scholarship are amply cited. See also David Howes, ed., Empire of the Senses, the sensual cultural reader (New York: Berg, 2004).

<sup>18</sup> Space precludes discussion of Ignatius' counsels about discerning real desires from distractions and deceptions. In brief, if I desire to find my way to the place of my heart's desire and if I stick with that desire over time my own experience will teach me when an impulse is what Ignatius calls "inordinate." In fact, the Exercises assume that inordinate impulses are a regular part of anyone's life experience, not a tragedy but a condition for engaging the world at both its worst and best. For a detailed study of this dimension of the Exercises see my "To Fall in Love with the World: Individualism and Self-Transcendence in American Life," Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits Vol 26, no. 3 (May 1994):" 1-28.

affection held in tension with the awareness that I may have to leave this place if my intuition opens me to some greater good?

Here the foundational premise of this theological approach plays a critical role: the world is good before it is suspect. If the world is suspect first and only good after I've worked at making it so, I will tend to make decisions defensively, choosing the lesser of several evils, or more assertively, choosing to fight and defeat some evil. Privileging suspicion fosters a correlative penchant for creating protected spaces inside of which I (or some we to whom I belong) maintain a zone of safety against an outside world understood as toxic and dangerous. At it's most extreme it is the world of brutally managed cults which exact as the high price for membership complete submission to the reigning orthodoxy inside.<sup>19</sup>

Privileging affection for the world means that I learn to risk affection for the unexpected and I don't lead with my defenses. I tend to make my decisions out of that affection, trying to understand what options are available to me at a given time as the set of limited and sometimes fragile goods among which I must choose. This stance comes with a correlative penchant for creating places of hospitality into which I can welcome friends and also strangers. At it's most extreme it is the world of astonishingly playful and durable people who make welcoming places for people who appear to be impossibly difficult. When I lived in Southwest Philadelphia on 46th and Chester during doctoral studies at the University of Pennsylvania, I became acquainted with a small community of nuns, nicknamed "the Purple Assumptions" from the name of their order and the color of their habit. They were polite and pious, even dainty, when serving tea or coffee in their little house. But on the streets of some of Philadelphia's tougher neighborhoods they went fearlessly about their work, mostly home nursing. One nun, whose name I no longer remember, ran a used clothing store. The empty lot immediately adjacent was home turf for a notorious motorcycle gang. One day I asked her whether the gang's proximity worried her. This tiny woman smiled and said sweetly, "No. They watch the place for me." These women lived the grace of hospitality at a high level on those mean streets.<sup>20</sup>

Hospitality is a demanding human art form. The place I create and maintain for welcoming cannot operate without some parameters that define what is and is not acceptable behavior; absent any parameters it ceases to be a place in any meaningful sense. On the other hand, to the extent that those parameters grow rigid and the definition of an acceptable guest narrows, the place in question can cease to be hospitable and evolve into a guarded space walled

---

<sup>19</sup> James Jone's cult with its appalling mass suicide in their isolated Jonestown encampment in Guyana remains the most horrific recent example, outdoing even David Koresh and the Branch Davidian Complex in Waco, Texas.

<sup>20</sup> The world wide L'Arche movement currently has 124 communities in thirty countries on five continents where people with mental handicaps live in community with more ordinary people. For founder Jean Vanier's theological interpretation see his Finding Peace (Toronto: The House of Anasi Press, 2003). For a compelling look at life in a Catholic farm community worked by a mix of volunteers and of ex convicts, living as equals and paying the price for such intimacy, see Bill Clarke, S.J. The Face of Friendship (Novalis, 2004).

off from the dangerous outer world.<sup>21</sup> The distinction between hospitable place and exclusive enclave cannot be defined with a clean and precise theological line. The parable of the farmer who built bigger barns for his good crop (Luke 12:13-21), if taken seriously as parables are meant to be, creates a zen moment of confusion to open a space for inner change. The zen moment here is the blunt assertion that the farmer is a fool for building the bigger barn to keep his harvest safe. What does this mean? Is everyone who does prudent financial planning or even uses door locks indicted -- why create private places inside of which to keep our selves and our stuff safe for the future? It is not so easy to be protected from anxiety and the line between prudent care of one's self and goods and futile anxiety is nearly invisible and easily crossed. So teaches the parable. Are door locks, which imply suspicion of unknown outsiders, and rules of conduct (e.g. no violence toward others when in our place) characteristic of suspicion or affection? They can be either and can elide from one state to the other with little warning.

Let me state the obvious. It is not easy to live extreme hospitality which welcomes people who are very hard to welcome. People who try to live this way understand that they need to take breaks when they allow themselves to be welcomed by people whom they trust and who care about them. Nonetheless, the alternative, living a life based on suspicion of the wide world, is vastly more corrosive both for individuals and for a society.<sup>22</sup> How then might one live an inner life that is emotionally healthy and at the same time affectionate toward the world as it presents itself? How live so that I am capable of approaching large and small decisions as choices of the greater among the limited goods available to me in a flawed world?

The Exercises do not understand the sort of heroic hospitality I have described as readily achievable; complete openness to the givens of actual life operates in the Exercises as something like an asymptotic ideal toward which one aspires, a life lived wholly out of a pragmatic realism but suffused with enduring affection. Not surprisingly, such a mystical state is articulated most thoroughly in the Exercise's conclusion, the "Contemplation to Attain the Love of God." (## 230-237). The grace one is invited to ask for here states the ideal: "Here it will be to ask for an intimate knowledge of the many blessings received, that filled with gratitude for all, I may in all things love and serve the Divine Majesty." The key words here are "intimate" and "all." What is the "all" that fills me with gratitude? All cannot be understood as a sanitized abstraction. The grace of the Contemplation assumes intimacy with the world as it is, living decisively and pursuing goals to which I am committed, but without the illusory defense of building walls that divide the safe and good from the dangerous and evil.

---

<sup>21</sup> The principle gets played out repeatedly and sometimes litigiously, as in lawsuits challenging racial or gender profiling as exclusionary devices or in gated communities.

<sup>22</sup> Parker Palmer's classic The Company of Strangers: Christians and the Renewal of America's Public Life (New York: Crossroads, 1981) argues compellingly that human beings and human societies need a balance of interaction with people they understand and trust and people who are strangers to them with whom they have to work out an often difficult accommodation. Too much of either over too long a time is a recipe for ill health.

The assumption that the world is good before it is suspect, which constitutes the heart of the matter, requires one more exploration of the Exercises. How might one learn to live and pray free from the schizoid habit of alternating between moments of beauty and playfulness walled off from other moments spent wounded and wary of the dangerous world? How in particular to make peace with reality's undeniable violences so that they need not be walled off from life's beauty? The Exercises approaches this question in two stages and the sequence between them is important. I must attend to my own wounds before giving my attention to the world's wounds. Let us consider them in that order. We begin with the painful process of retrieving that which I find despicable in myself, a process to which the Exercises devotes the first of its four weeks.<sup>23</sup>

In the Exercises, selective attention that screens out the negative is understood as an interruption in the inner journey. The Exercise's first great movement of grace (called "the first week") involves an inner journey on which I seek what has worn me down and threatened to break my spirit, the violences done to me and done by me. It is almost unspeakably difficult to seek my violent places and harder still to stay in them, enduring my grief and anger and fear, while those avoided places do their worst. Ignatius counsels that I stay in the bitter place "until I have been satisfied," until I can surrender the illusion that I have the power to erase that which distresses me and I can allow myself to be known and loved in that dimension of myself.<sup>24</sup> It is no wonder that desolations are understood to equal consolations as guides toward the place of heart's desire. No wonder either that Ignatius leaves open the question of how long to stay with the expression "until I am satisfied."

One begins the Exercises by making peace with the parts of life that require compassion. Absent a credible experience of joy about the self I find at my worst, efforts to do good in the world tend to become sacrificial offerings to demon gods which lurk on the edges of my awareness. Self contempt corrodes generosity. By the same token, the joy that comes from finding my whole self beloved and beautiful opens me to a world larger than my personal needs.

From the end of the First week on, the Exercises invite the retreatant to contemplate Jesus as the one who has fallen in love with the flawed, beautiful and dangerous world. The grace for which I pray in the Second Week is "for an intimate knowledge of our Lord, who has become a human being for me, that I may love Him more and follow Him more closely."<sup>25</sup> If I fall in love with Jesus as the one who loved me in my most destructive personal places, I can begin to fall in love with the world, to pay less attention to how well I am doing and more to the

---

<sup>23</sup> At the risk of excessive repetition, I need to point out interpreting the four week dynamic of the Exercises would require much more space than is available here.

<sup>24</sup> A metaphor might help here. When a community discovers a toxic dump site in their living space it is a perfectly sensible short term solution to put a fence around the place to avoid it's dangers. In the long run, however, one must take down the fence and reclaim the land so that people can live there again. So too with the toxicities of my past.

<sup>25</sup> This prayer gained salience in that song "Day by Day" in Godspell: "To see thee more clearly, love thee more dearly, follow thee more nearly, day by day."

world as I find it. So does the Second Week understand the move from a focus on self improvement to an identity of active citizenship in the world.

In the perspective of the Exercises, following Jesus requires a capacity for tenderness and playful joy; I give the world permission, so to speak, to reveal its beauty to me. It also requires a capacity for courage in the presence of the world's terrible places. For one example from many of Ignatius' insistence on integrating tenderness and violence, consider the third point proposed for the birth of Jesus. Immediately after contemplating the intimacies of Mary and Joseph giving birth, the retreatant is invited ". . . to see and consider what they are doing, for example, making the journey and laboring that our Lord might be born in extreme poverty, and that after many labors, after hunger, thirst, heat, and cold, after insults and outrages, He might die on the cross , and all this for me."<sup>26</sup> The director needs to be attentive here to the retreatant's affective experience. To miss the poverty and violence of the life Jesus will live or to miss the disarming tenderness of his birth is to miss the point.

To love the world in imitation of Jesus requires love of its beauty and a willingness to leave the beauty for the world's violent places, or vice versa. When to stay where I am now and when to seek a next place of heart's desire? When is staying where I am a grace for me? When is it arrogant bravado? When is it evasive cowardice? These are hard decisions. Should we and our growing children leave inner city Detroit where we have thus far felt called to live now that they approach school age? Should I remain in Brazil's agricultural basin despite repeated death threats? Should I continue to hold tenure at my university? Should I use several months of my work year practicing medicine in South Los Angeles on a pro bono basis? Do I need a longer vacation than I'd planned, in a suitably beautiful and restful place among people I thoroughly enjoy? Should we just sit together by the river and visit this evening? Large decisions or seemingly small ones require attention to what in the world stirs consolation or desolation.

In a core meditation titled "On the Three Classes of Human Beings," the Exercises present such decisions as a delicate inner process in which I seek to neither stay nor leave my present situation. In the meditation, three types of people have inherited a fortune and not by criminal means. Each understands that s/he is too attached to the fortune, that the fortune endangers her/his integrity. The first two types do nothing effective about their inordinate attachment. One might expect, then, that the third type of person will divest her/himself of the money. Wrong. The third type of person desires "neither to retain nor to relinquish" the fortune.

---

<sup>26</sup> Exercises # 116

“ They will strive to conduct themselves as if every attachment to it had been broken. They will make efforts neither to want that, nor anything else unless the service of God our Lord alone move them to do so.” (# 155)

The ideal proposed in the third type of person is that I hold love for my life as it is now in balance with openness to a different situation, neither desiring a long life over a short life, health over sickness, wealth over poverty. This is this mystical heart of the way of prayer taught in the Exercises, not so much a Zen open consciousness as a receptivity that is both passionate and supple, loving the flawed and limited realities that constitute the present moment in one's life and open to what may be given in the next. It is a very demanding ideal of realistic love.

Ignatius knows it and takes into account that people do not live long on the heights of love. Immediately after the meditation on the three types of human beings, he writes one of his most revealing bits of advice for the retreatant. "It should be noted that when we feel an attachment opposed to [being completely open to any of the options facing me] . . . , when we are not indifferent to poverty and riches, it will be very helpful in order to overcome the inordinate attachment, even though corrupt nature rebel against it, to beg our Lord . . . to choose us to serve him in actual poverty. . . provided, of course, that it be for the service and praise of the Divine Goodness." (#157)

If I try to live as if all the options facing me (sickness or health, danger or safety, financial security or insecurity) have the potential to be the greater good for the next step in my life, I should expect to experience ordinarily human resistance on a regular basis. It is not easy to love the world without fencing off the bad parts, and I ought to expect mood swings.<sup>27</sup> Seeking the greater good means, then, that I make decisions about when to remain and when to change my place in the world as if every option possible to me is good. If I abandon the illusion that I, or the world in which I live, can be divided into schizoid regions which are all good or all evil, and if I allow myself to love a world in which goodness and tragedy are intertwined, I will discover, over and over, that I must choose among flawed goods. My principle sorrow, then, will be to leave aside very good possibilities so that I can give myself to another good which seems greater to me even with its flaws. In short, the heart of the mystical ideal of following Jesus to the next place to which I am invited requires self knowledge, a willingness to be comforted when I get in over my head, a capacity to entrust myself to the love of my allies, and a sense of humor.

To seek the greater good means that I pay attention to how the world's realities stir me to consolation and to desolation and that I pay attention to both sorts of experience so that I can discern when to stay in my present situation and when to leave for some new place. As I

---

<sup>27</sup> Twice more in practical notes for the director, Ignatius suggests that the retreatant will experience negative affect pretty regularly. See # 159 end of 2nd paragraph and # 199 end of second paragraph.

attempt this over time, I am meant to grow in self knowledge and world knowledge. My mix of good and bad behavior should begin to be comfortably familiar to me. The world should become larger, more interesting, more challenging and more diverse. But I am also meant to grow in affection, for my self and the people and situations of my world, and grow in my capacity to receive the affection which is offered to me by a flawed and lovely world of people and places. Such is the ideal of seeking the greater good as understood in the Spiritual Exercises.

### **Conclusion:**

From the perspective of this exploration of the *Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius* it does not matter much that I live in a society culturally and technologically oriented by reliable electric lights toward a lust for immediate clarity as I suspect all of us in this room do. To be sure it helps to be aware of biases fostered by technologies that are so embedded in my culture's infrastructure that they appear to be the natural state of things. And it is wise for people who seek to live more out of affection than suspicion to expect the biases of electric lighting to make their presence known in one's mood swings: occasional itching for premature clarity and suspicion about who and what appears alien or hard to understand.

Might it be possible to develop a theology which encourages treating the strange and dangerous parts of the world as parts of a larger good which one seeks? In this era of more than ordinary contempt for those with whom one differs, might it be possible to foster a habit of mutual reverence that is not based on facile tolerance but grounded in a fundamental expectation that what I find repugnant or strange may offer me access to the presence of God in a world suffused with God's affection? I think Ignatius is correct in assuming that I can only engage the world on such demanding terms if I don't mind lots of personal bad behavior. But if I can allow the people who love me to comfort me at my worst, to stir my courage and refresh my sense of humor, then, as a grace filled side effect of our common efforts to treat the world with affection rather than with suspicion, my various forms of unhappy behavior -- mood swings, griefs, angers and fears -- can nourish a compassion in me for the bad behavior of those with whom I differ.

### **Appendix: Several Corollaries**

1) The Spiritual Exercises as medieval about sensuality and modern about geography: The Exercises are medieval in that the physical, cognitive, and affective dimensions of experience are not neatly compartmentalized. I think of a wood carving which serves as the arm rest between two medieval choir stalls in Chester Cathedral. The not very large figure has the

hindquarters of something like a dog while the front quarters portray a human being playing a stringed instrument something like a rebec. The carving is rich with medieval European sensibility, at once a sermon on the intimate entanglement of human spiritual creativity and animal sensuality and at the same time a joke told to the monks who would sit in those stalls singing the praises of God.

On the other hand, the Exercises are utterly modern in their awareness of the world as vast and inviting place, and their commitment to go out into the larger than European world, here in the service of God's love of all the world's diverse people.<sup>28</sup> Jerome Nadal, the early Jesuits' most important interpreter, after Ignatius, of the new order's charism, wrote in 1554: "It should be noted that in the Society (of Jesus) There are different kinds of houses or dwellings. These are: the house of probation, the college, the professed house, and the journey, and by this last the whole world becomes our house. [my emphasis]. In addition to the three vows traditional for religious congregations -- poverty celibacy and obedience -- Jesuits take a vow of mobility, to go anywhere in the world "for the good of souls."<sup>29</sup>

Living the discipline of global mobility is a form of adult integrity and requires the maturity of an adult much as do other life-shaping commitments such as living a permanent intimate relationship; living with the demands of a profession; or in a notable contrast to Jesuit mobility, living the Benedictine vow of stability. Jesuit commitment to the journey by which "the whole world becomes our home" requires the capacity to grow intimate with the place where I find myself even if my journey takes me from that place again. It is a measure of how well one lives the virtue of the journey that I experience real sadness when leaving. This is surely true when leaving a place where I have lived a long time but it can also be true of a stay so short as a weekend conference or an evening's visit in the home of a friend. It is not foolish, from this perspective, to say goodbye and thank you to the hotel room which has sheltered me for two nights, and to the ordinarily invisible people who clean my room while I stayed.

## 2) "Magis" vs "Majorem":

AMDG (Ad Majorem Dei Gloriam - "Toward the Greater Glory of God") comes from the Exercises and is embedded in Jesuit iconography world wide. Today, Jesuits and their compatriots make much of "The Magis," a noun that has elided from the original adjective

---

<sup>28</sup> This is not to deny the frequent blending of religious and colonial ambitions so often evident in the behavior of European colonizers, clerical as well as lay. The Exercises, however, appear to be conceived in terms of the working of a God who loves the world in its broad and diverse extent, hardly a proselytizing God. For a vivid expression of a larger and more diverse world view within the Exercises, see the first point in the contemplation of the Incarnation. (#106):

"This will be to see the different persons: First, those on the face of the earth, in such diversity in dress and in manner of acting. Some are white, some black; some at peace, and some at war; some weeping, some laughing; some well, some sick; some coming into the world, and some dying ; etc."

<sup>29</sup> For recent historical research on early Jesuit commitment to engage the larger world see The Jesuits: Cultures, Sciences, and The Arts, 1540-1773 Editors: John W. O'Malley, S.J., Gauvin Alexander Bailey, Steven J. Harris, and T. Frank Kennedy, S.J. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999) especially Steven J. Harris "Mapping Jesuit Science: The Role of Travel in the Geography of Knowledge," pp. 212-240.

"majorem" (greater). "The Magis" suffers from its possible interpretation as something like Max Weber's iron cage of rationality: a relentless and never sleeping insistence that one pursue what is better than the present (as in: "Don't tell me what you did yesterday; tell me what you will do tomorrow."). Relentless scrutiny privileges the future over the past where affection for the past is understood as nostalgic distraction. The Exercises do not understand *ad majorem Dei gloriam* in that fashion. "Majorem" is an adjective and its governing preposition, "ad," carries equal weight: "toward the greater glory of God." "Toward" implies not random movement, but a search for what one desires. Life, in this world view, is lived as a rhythm of seeking, finding, and then staying in a place of heart's desire. The habit of seeking the greater among available goods understands grief not as misfortune but as a healthy and expected part of life's rhythm. The goods which I choose and which I allow myself to love are always flawed. Sometimes I grieve about the roads not taken; sometimes about the ending of a much loved part of my life which I choose to leave; sometimes because of my uncertainty at a time of important decision. Sometimes, finally, I grieve because I am connected to the world which is, at turns, violent and brutal. Grief in all circumstances arises in me precisely because I do not treat myself as decoupled from the world. There is no clean space available to me as if I could exist alongside the world rather than in it. Because I experience myself as part of the world, I am vulnerable to its violence and its beauty.

3) Emotional health and the Exercises:

I have understated the important presupposition that one should not attempt the Exercises without durable emotional health. At the beginning of the Exercises and at key transition points later, the director must pay attention to the readiness of the retreatant for what is to follow. A tell tale sign of readiness is a capacity for deep affection for my self and for the world, revealed especially by the ability to be moved by beauty. Alternately, a sign that one ought not to proceed with the exercises would be evidence of deep-seated anxiety about or disaffection for my self or for the realities of the world.